

Spraying Manure emails after September 2017



Jean Mendoza

To: Christopher Spitters

Cc: kathy.lofy@doh.wa.gov,

cathy.wasserman@doh.wa.gov,

Fox, Julie R (DOH)

Sep 10, 2017 at 9:15 AM

[Details](#)

Re: Respiratory Health in Yakima County

Hello Dr. Spitters,

How are you doing? Well, I hope.

As you know air quality in the Yakima Valley has been pretty bad in recent weeks. This makes our concerns more pressing. Is there any progress on evaluating the impact of manure spreading/spraying during adverse air events?

I have recently talked with a water scientist, not an air scientist, who observes that some effects from air and water pollution are not additive but synergistic. Can you address this point as well?

Let me add some more information regarding air emissions. During discussion within the Lower Yakima Valley Groundwater Management Area representatives from the South Yakima Conservation District and the Yakima Dairy Federation tell us that 70% of manure in our area is composted. This is good news for the groundwater but bad news for the air. I am attaching one potential model for what happens to the nitrogen from cow manure in our valley. This is just a model and the results are easily manipulated, but it is a starting point for discussion.

Thanks and best wishes.

Jean Mendoza

On Jul 17, 2017, at 08:56 AM, Christopher Spitters <christopher.spitters@comcast.net> wrote:

Hi, Jean.

Last week I communicated with Julie Fox, the primary DOH staff member on this issue. She is back working on the issue after several months of other priorities for her limited time taking precedence. More to come,

Chris

From: Jean Mendoza <jeanmendoza@icloud.com>

Date: Sunday, July 16, 2017 at 8:47 PM

To: <kathy.lofy@doh.wa.gov>, <cathy.wasserman@doh.wa.gov>

Cc: Christopher Spitters <christopher.spitters@comcast.net>

Subject: Respiratory Health in Yakima County

Hello Dr. Lofy & Dr. Wasserman,

Last fall I sent you and Dr. Spitters from the Yakima Health District a letter asking for an opinion on the health risks when manures are spread or sprayed during periods of poor air quality.

I traveled to Yakima last month to ask Dr. Spitters for an update and he tells me he is still waiting to receive an opinion from the Department of Health. Do you have any new information regarding this potential and probable threat to the people of Yakima County?

This is important to us. Last February, during some prolonged inversions, a child died in the Lower Yakima Valley due to complications from asthma.

Sincerely,

Jean Mendoza



GWMA Anal...thways.docx
118 KB

* * * * *



Fox, Julie R (DOH)

To: Jean Mendoza

Sep 20, 2017 at 3:03 PM

[Details](#)

discuss Dept of Health review?

Dear Jean Mendoza,

I learned that you would like an update about the status of the Department of Health's review of land application of manure. I am the ambient air quality specialist who has been looking into this issue.

Would you like to arrange a time to talk by phone?

Sincerely,

Julie

Julie Richman Fox, PhD, MHS

Ambient Air Environmental Epidemiologist

* * * * *



Fox, Julie R (DOH)

To: Jean Mendoza, Spitters, Christopher (DOHi)

Nov 28, 2017 at 3:37 PM

[Details](#)

RE: More Data

Hello Jean Mendoza,

Thank you! I had this article too, but it's good to ensure that I've got all of the most current and relevant literature.

Best wishes,

Julie

From: Jean Mendoza [mailto:jeanmendoza@icloud.com]

Sent: Sunday, November 26, 2017 11:14 PM

To: Fox, Julie R (DOH) <julie.fox@doh.wa.gov>; Spitters, Christopher (DOHi) <christopher.spitters@comcast.net>

Subject: More Data

Hello Dr. Fox & Dr. Spitters,

Here is an additional reference to support our concerns about health risks from spreading/spraying manure during inversions. As you know Yakima County has a problem with campylobacter.

Thanks

Jean Mendoza

* * * * *



Teresa Everson

To: Jean Mendoza

Apr 25, 2018 at 12:12 PM

[Details](#)

RE: following up your question re: manure spraying in Yakima Co

Hi Jean-

It was nice to meet you this morning.

Here is the recently published study out of Wisconsin we talked about:

<https://ehp.niehs.nih.gov/ehp283/>

It is quite technical/dense, but the summary and discussion starting about 3/4 of the way down the page are quite helpful.

Here are some more palatable recommendations for the practice:

<https://fyi.uwex.edu/manureirrigation/files/2017/04/Manure-Irrigation-Workgroup-Report-2016.pdf>

I will let you know how much time Holly and I can carve out after the May Board of Health meeting after she is back from her trip.

Dr. Everson

From: Jean Mendoza [jeanmendoza@icloud.com]

Sent: Tuesday, April 24, 2018 10:03 PM

To: Teresa Everson

Subject: Re: following up your question re: manure spraying in Yakima Co

Hello Dr. Everson,

It is very nice to meet you. I will try to attend the YHD Board meeting tomorrow morning and hope that you will save a few minutes for an introductory conversation.

It is very nice to meet you. I will try to attend the YHD Board meeting tomorrow morning and hope that you will save a few minutes for an introductory conversation.

Thanks

Jean Mendoza

On Apr 24, 2018, at 12:20 PM, Teresa Everson <eversont@ohsu.edu> wrote:

Hi Jean-

This is Dr. Everson, the new health officer for the Yakima Health District.

Dr. Spitters let me know during our transition that you had an outstanding question regarding the health impacts of manure irrigation/spraying and I wanted to give you a brief update.

The Department of Health (DOH) was awaiting the publication of a large new study from the University of Wisconsin about this agricultural practice and its benefits and risks, and that study was released this past winter and detailed requirements for safe practice.

The DOH has assembled a statewide committee to consider this practice as it relates to public health and to compile recommendations for policy moving forward, and our own Environmental Health Director, Holly Myers, has volunteered to serve on that committee.

Holly is out of state at the moment, but we have committed time in May to considering possible local policy while the DOH considers appropriate language for state-level policy.

Moving forward Holly is still the best primary contact for your questions, but I wanted to take the opportunity to provide some follow-up as this was specifically on Dr. Spitter's mind.

Dr. Everson

Teresa Everson, MD, MPH, CPH
Health Officer, Yakima Health District

Deputy Health Officer, Clark and Skamania Counties, Washington
Assistant Professor, OHSU Family Medicine
Adjunct Assistant Professor, OHSU-PSU School of Public Health

* * * * *



Murinko, Shawn (DOH)

To: Jean Mendoza Cc: Hoff, Christy Curwick (DOH)

May 3, 2018 at 9:59 AM

[Details](#)

RE: Letter of Complaint

Christy and I look forward to speaking with you then.

[Shawn Murinko](#)

Chief of Civil Rights & Risk Management

[Washington State Department of Health](#)

Office for Civil Rights & Risk Management

PO Box 47890

Olympia, WA 98504-7890

(360) 236-4010

Administrative Assistant: [Marquita Rossman](#)

(360) 236-4008

Gender Pronouns: He/Him

We'd appreciate your feedback on this short [customer service survey](#).

From: Jean Mendoza [mailto:jeanrmendoza@icloud.com]

Sent: Thursday, May 3, 2018 9:46 AM

To: Murinko, Shawn (DOH) <shawn.murinko@doh.wa.gov>

Cc: Hoff, Christy Curwick (DOH) <Christy.Hoff@sboh.wa.gov>

Subject: Re: Letter of Complaint

Dear Mr./Ms. Murinko,

I would be very grateful for the opportunity to talk with you today. 1200 noon works best for me. I will plan on calling then unless I hear differently.

Thanks

Jean

On May 03, 2018, at 07:59 AM, "Murinko, Shawn (DOH)" <shawn.murinko@doh.wa.gov> wrote:

Dear Ms. Mendoza:

Do you have some time today to talk? Christy Hoff (from the State Board of Health) and I have time between 12:00 and 12:50 today. We would like to clarify the issues you are raising. Please let me know what works best for you so I can hold the time on our calendars. I can be reached at 360.236.4010 or we can call you if you provide me with a number to reach you. Otherwise, we can schedule another day and time that's convenient for you. Thanks.

[Shawn Murinko](#)

Chief of Civil Rights & Risk Management

[Washington State Department of Health](#)

Office for Civil Rights & Risk Management

PO Box 47890

Olympia, WA 98504-7890

(360) 236-4010

Administrative Assistant: [Marquita Rossman](#)

(360) 236-4008

Gender Pronouns: He/Him

We'd appreciate your feedback on this short [customer service survey](#).

From: Jean Mendoza [<mailto:jeanrmendoza@icloud.com>]

Sent: Thursday, May 3, 2018 5:50 AM

To: Murinko, Shawn (DOH) <shawn.murinko@doh.wa.gov>

Subject: Re: Letter of Complaint

Good Morning Mr./Ms. Murinko,

Thank you for your quick response. Are you refusing our request for a meeting?

Jean Mendoza

On May 02, 2018, at 03:52 PM, "Murinko, Shawn (DOH)" <shawn.murinko@doh.wa.gov> wrote:

Dear Ms. Mendoza:

I have reviewed your attached complaint; it does not appear that DOH's actions, as you describe them, would be an issue that my office would handle. I will, however, forward it to the appropriate program for any follow-up they deem appropriate.

Thank you for contacting the Washington State Department of Health.

[Shawn Murinko](#)

Chief of Civil Rights & Risk Management

[Washington State Department of Health](#)

Office for Civil Rights & Risk Management

PO Box 47890

Olympia, WA 98504-7890

(360) 236-4010

Administrative Assistant: [Marquita Rossman](#)

We'd appreciate your feedback on this short [customer service survey](#).

From: Jean Mendoza [<mailto:jeanmendoza@icloud.com>]

Sent: Wednesday, May 2, 2018 9:33 AM

To: Murinko, Shawn (DOH) <shawn.murinko@doh.wa.gov>

Subject: Letter of Complaint

Dear Shawn Murinko,

Please see the attached letter of complaint. I hope that this is an issue that can be quickly resolved with your help.

Sincerely,

Jean Mendoza

* * * * *



Holly Myers

To: Jean Mendoza Cc: 'Teresa Everson', Andre Fresco, Ryan Ibach

May 3, 2018 at 12:04 PM

[Details](#)

RE: Meeting with Dr. Everson and Jean Mendoza

Sounds good.

For clarification. There has been reference to a work group or committee formed around the manure spraying issue. The workgroup I have volunteered to participate on is not focused on the manure spraying issue but rather it is formed to review manure composting.

Holly R Myers

EH Director

Yakima Health District

1210 Ahtanum Ridge Dr.

Union Gap 98903

509 249 6504

"You must be the change you want to see in the world."

– **Mahatma Gandhi**

From: Jean Mendoza <jeanrmendoza@icloud.com>

Sent: Thursday, May 03, 2018 11:41 AM

To: Holly Myers <holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us>

Cc: 'Teresa Everson' <eversont@ohsu.edu>

Subject: Re: Meeting with Dr. Everson and Jean Mendoza

Good Morning Holly & Dr. Everson,

The meeting is on my calendar. I plan to send relevant information over the next few weeks.

Thanks so much.

Jean

On May 03, 2018, at 11:18 AM, Holly Myers <holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us> wrote:

Certainly.

From: Teresa Everson <eversont@ohsu.edu>

Sent: Thursday, May 03, 2018 11:14 AM

To: Holly Myers <holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us>; Jean Mendoza <jeanrmendoza@icloud.com>

Subject: RE: Meeting with Dr. Everson and Jean Mendoza

Can we make this 10-10:30? I believe the board of health meeting ends at 10a and I'm needing to meet with the communicable disease team at 10:30.

Thanks,

te

* * * * *



Kathleen Rogers
To: Jean Mendoza

May 28, 2018 at 10:36 AM

[Details](#)

Re: Fwd: Conversation re Manure Spraying

This is wonderful news! As the summer approaches with its heat and inversions, I am very worried that we will have once more not only the pen dirt, the manure sprays, etc, we will have another year of horrible smoke sent in from various natural fires around us. It was deathly last year. The smoke and the "invisible" pen dirt, hidden in the cloud of smoke, both invaded our health. It was the worst year of my life living here in the middle of it all with these CAFO's and their disrespect for our air quality and quality of life for the neighbors.

What kind of meeting are you thinking? With YRCAA or with GWMA, or the public? We can talk about it in length Thursday. I am all for it!!!! Thank you Jean for this amazing letter. It says it all.

Kathleen Rogers

Being Reasonable Test:

#1- is it reasonable to believe one rain drop is the cause of the flood or the drought?

#2- Is it reasonable to believe 10's of thousands of head of cows on approx. 1 sq. mi. of agricultural land will not impact the environment of air and water?

Good Morning Kathleen & Bud,

FYI. If all goes well I will ask for another larger meeting. Dr. Everson is new to the Yakima Health District and I think she wants to do the right thing. This might be an opportunity to make a good first impression.

Thanks
Jean

Begin forwarded message:

From: Jean Mendoza <jeanmendoza@icloud.com>
Date: May 28, 2018 9:09:03 AM
To: Teresa Everson <everson@ohsu.edu>, holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us
Cc: keith@yrcaa.org
Subject: Conversation re Manure Spraying

Hello Holly & Dr. Everson,

I am looking forward to our conversation next Wednesday. My hope is to ensure that people who live in the Lower Yakima Valley are included in Washington State decision making regarding the spraying and spreading of manure. Here are my thoughts after reading the Wisconsin studies.

These and other studies ask how many people can be infected with pathogens from aerosolized manure before we become concerned. Mark Borchardt, a USDA micro-biologist and member of the Wisconsin work group, has stated, "It really is a societal decision as to what is acceptable."

The people of the Lower Yakima Valley who incur these risks are by definition the impacted society. We deserve a prominent place at the table when policy is formulated and we should receive relevant information in understandable layman's terms. All involved need clear and accurate data from the WA State Department of Health (DOH) regarding elevated rates of infection, birth defects, morbidity and mortality in Yakima County.

With all due respect, the bureaucrats who typically make these hard choices do not live with manure laden air day in and day out. When people who live here say that family members no longer want to visit because of putrid odors (not just barnyard odors) that fact should be taken seriously.

A longstanding goal for the Friends of Toppenish Creek is a countywide ban on spraying and spreading manures during air inversions. The Wisconsin work group report validates our concern and underscores the importance of this restriction. The Wisconsin report recommends against manure irrigation during inversions due to drift (pages 31, 33), odor (pages 36 37), air quality (pages 46, 48), and spreading pathogens (pages 53, 54).

Campylobacter is a major concern in the Wisconsin studies (Genskow & Larson, 2016) and in Idaho studies (Dungan, 2014). There is a direct correlation between increased rates of Campylobacter infection and high concentrations of dairies in Washington State (Davis et al, 2013). WA DOH statistics show very high rates for this disease in the Lower Yakima Valley where 35% of the state's milk cows are housed.

The work group report lists Cryptosporidium among zoonotic infections from cattle. This protozoon is waterborne and survives for long periods of time in soil. Dairy calf operations in the LYV have been re-located due to Cryptosporidium infestation of calf hutches and pens. The USDA finds that, on any given day, 22% of pre-weaned calves are shedding this organism. (USDA 1993, USDA 2016). We have high rates of Cryptosporidium in humans.

The referenced Wisconsin research only looks at gastrointestinal infections potentially related to manure irrigation. This is a small part of the total health impact from spraying and spreading manures.

About 14% of transmission of zoonotic diseases from cattle to humans is by inhalation. Major routes are:

- Ingestion 34%
- Cutaneous 30%
- Vector borne 18%
- Inhalation 14%
- Vertical 4% (McDaniel et al, 2014).

Zoonotic agents in cattle by microbiological category are:

- Bacteria 42%
- Parasite 29%
- Virus 22%
- Fungus 5%
- Prion 2% (McDaniel et al, 2014)

The only U.S. outbreak of Mad Cow disease, a prion related infection, occurred in the Lower Yakima Valley in 2003. This occurred next to the Yakama Indian Reservation and the small city of Mabton where 91.9% of the population is Latino and 26.8% of the population lives below the federal poverty level. Potentially infected calves were killed in order to contain the outbreak. Some were dumped in a wildlife refuge next to the Yakima River and those who did this were never prosecuted. Prions live in the soil for years and cause chronic wasting disease in deer and elk.

There are no guidance documents for manure spraying in Washington State. In Wisconsin producers are only allowed to use irrigation application of manures after receiving a state license. There is no such licensing in Washington. (Genskow & Larson, 2016).

It appears that all farms in Wisconsin are required to have and implement nutrient management plans (NMPs). Public health officials need to know that, in the State of Washington, dairies are required to develop NMPs but there is no requirement to follow them. (WSDA, 2017, page 11).

In Washington dairies are allowed to dispose of dead animals in their compost operations. Composting involves stacking manures in windrows and turning the manures at specified times. (WA State Dept of Ecology, 2005). This results in volatilization of a wide variety of potentially hazardous chemicals into the ambient air. There are essentially no inspections of manure composting in Yakima County.

In Wisconsin all CAFOs are required to have a Wisconsin Pollution Discharge Elimination System Permit. In Washington this is only required if a dairy has a documented discharge to waters of the state. Only 23 out of over 450 Washington dairies have National Pollution Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permits. Thus requirements that make manure application safer are missing in Washington.

The work group report talks a great deal about setback distances for manure irrigation. It appears that the setback distances in Washington are much less restrictive. In Western Washington during the summer months dairies are allowed to apply manures within 10 feet of water bodies and critical areas. (WSDA, 2018)

The work group report (page 22, Table 2C-3) states that manure irrigation is prohibited within 500 feet of a dwelling in Wisconsin. In the Lower Yakima Valley there is a manure lagoon within 150 feet of a family home. Manures have been applied to the land and stacked within 50 feet of a family home.

In addition to gastrointestinal infections bovine to human agents may attack the pulmonary system, the integumentary system, the cardiovascular system, the nervous system and the reproductive system. (McDaniel et al, 2014).

Spray application of manure increases volatilization of ammonia and other hazardous chemicals by orders of magnitude. (Rotz, 2004). This is likely a greater source of risk to public health than infectious disease.

The WA State Department of Ecology (2014) has documented high levels of wintertime nitrates in the Yakima County air. Nitrates combine with ammonia to form fine particulate matter; a known and major threat to public health. About 31% of the fine particulate matter in the Lower Yakima Valley is ammonium nitrate. The ammonia is generated by animal feeding operations.

In 2011 Williams et al from John Hopkins University found bovine allergen bos d-2 inside homes near Yakima Valley dairies. They found cow allergen associated with airborne particulate matter at levels that were statistically significant up to three miles from dairies.

The University of Washington found decreased lung function in asthmatic Yakima children within two days of adverse air events and a greater impact from ammonia than from particulate matter. (Loftus, 2014). Air pollution not only impacts asthmatic children, it is also a likely cause of asthma and impairs healthy lung development.

On Saturday, May 26, 2018, we talked by telephone with Lynn Utesch, the only citizen in the 20 member Wisconsin work group. Mr. Utesch told us that he unsuccessfully asked to have his name removed from the report. The reason is that many of the report recommendations were "data free". Proponents of manure irrigation screened and edited the report and excluded significant and relevant research. Studies on respiratory health were excluded. National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) studies that described ammonia plumes, ammonia transport and resulting eutrophication were excluded.

Washington task forces could easily suffer the same fate. It is common practice for people from industry to "stack the deck" and control the outcome of a work group. If Washington chooses to study the implications of aerial application of manures to cropland the people of Yakima County and other impacted areas deserve an equal voice. The Friends of Toppenish Creek sincerely hope that the Yakima Health District will support this vision. Because this issue is so very important I will share this letter with others who advocate for the people of the Yakima Valley and Washington State.

Thank you for the opportunity to talk and expand on this issue.

Jean Mendoza

* * * * *



Holly Myers
To: Jean Mendoza

Jun 1, 2018 at 12:45 PM

[Details](#)

RE: Infectious Disease & CAFOs

Thank you Jean.

You left a disc for me. Did you want me to send that along to Yakima Regional Clean Air?

I do not have a disc reader on my system but can send it along or access it another way if necessary. I wasn't sure what the intention of leaving the disc was. Please advise.

From: Jean Mendoza <jeanmendoza@icloud.com>

Sent: Monday, January 01, 2018 6:58 AM

To: Holly Myers <holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us>

Subject: Infectious Disease & CAFOs

Hello Holly,

Thank you for our conversation last week. I greatly appreciate your sincerity and desire to optimize the health of people who live in Yakima County.

When I say dairies make people sick I am not just expressing an opinion. Here is data regarding incidence of *Campylobacter jejuni* and cattle. My PP is based on DOH data. It has not been updated since 2012.

Thanks for reading. Best wishes for a wonderful New Year.

Jean Mendoza

* * * * *



Piazza, Millie (ECY)

To: Jean Mendoza

Jun 5, 2018 at 7:14 PM

[Details](#)

RE: Environmental Justice

Thank you for this letter Jean. I also emailed Lauren and Paj to let them know I was available to talk if they would like any context/background for your letter. Best,
Millie

Millie Piazza, PhD

Environmental Justice Coordinator, WA State Department of Ecology

millie.piazza@ecy.wa.gov / Desk: (360) 407-6177 / Cell: (360) 489-2416

From: Jean Mendoza [mailto:jeanrmendoza@icloud.com]

Sent: Monday, June 4, 2018 9:54 AM

To: Nandi, Paj (DOH) <paj.nandi@doh.wa.gov>

Cc: Piazza, Millie (ECY) <mpia461@ECY.WA.GOV>; DOH WSOBH Health Disparities Council <healthequity@sboh.wa.gov>; DOH WSOBH Health Disparities Council <healthequity@sboh.wa.gov>; Tezka4@gmail.com

Subject: Environmental Justice

Good Morning Mr. Nandi,

I am the executive director for the Friends of Toppenish Creek, a 501 C (3) non-profit environmental advocacy group in rural Yakima County. We met briefly at the last meeting of the Governor's Interagency Council on Health Disparities.

I am writing with a very specific request. We understand that the Department of Health and possibly other agencies will be convening work groups and/or task forces to refine WA State policy on the spraying/spreading of manures and regulation of manure composting. We ask for your help to ensure that impacted populations, including minority groups that are more likely to be affected, have several seats at the table.

Here is some background. The Friends of Toppenish Creek have twice petitioned the Yakima Regional Clean Air Agency to prohibit the spraying/spreading of manures during air inversions. Our request has been rejected both times. In 2016 we asked the Yakima Health District to provide an opinion on the adverse health impacts from this practice. The health district deferred to the WA Dept. of Health and DOH has been working on the issues since then.

The Yakima Health District sent us a link to research that was recently done in Wisconsin. A work group there clearly recommended that manure irrigation should not take place during inversions in order to reduce odor, drift, ammonia levels, air quality and pathogens in the air. In Wisconsin farmers must apply for a permit before they can engage in manure irrigation (manure spraying).

Through recent conversations we have learned that the state is considering changes/improvements to related policies. Based on experiences in Yakima County and elsewhere we fear that the people who live near manure spraying/spreading and composting operations will be left out of the decision making. Is it possible for you to track the formation of work groups/task forces on manure irrigation and manure composting and connect us with the appropriate people in order to make our voices heard?

Thank you so much for your time and effort.

Jean Mendoza

Friends of Toppenish Creek

509-874-2798

* * * * *



Barik, Sanjay (ECY)

To: Jean Mendoza



Jun 8, 2018 at 3:12 PM

[Details](#)

RE: Infectious Disease & CAFOs

Hi Jean,

Thank you for forwarding the e-mails. The e-mail below has very interesting interpretation of environmental justice.

Hope you are doing well.

Regards,

Sanjay Barik

Section Manager

Air Quality Program

Washington State Department of Ecology

From: Jean Mendoza [mailto:jeanrmendoza@icloud.com]
Sent: Monday, June 4, 2018 10:28 AM
To: Barik, Sanjay (ECY) <SABA461@ECY.WA.GOV>
Subject: Fwd: Infectious Disease & CAFOs

And here is more.

Begin forwarded message:

From: Jean Mendoza <jeanrmendoza@icloud.com>
Date: June 03, 2018 5:54:38 AM
To: Holly Myers <holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us>
Cc: Teresa Everson <everson@ohsu.edu>, Larry Fendell <lgfendell@embarqmail.com>, Kathleen Rogers <kakaleena1@yahoo.com>, Roland Rogers <nstarmgt@msn.com>, Jim Dyjak <Dyjak@nwinfo.net>
Subject: **Re: Infectious Disease & CAFOs**

Good Morning Holly,

Here is the story behind the video. For ten plus years Kathleen Rogers has complained to the Yakima Regional Clean Air Agency about air pollution from dairies next to her home. Jim Dyjak and Larry Fendell have complained to the YRCAA for 20 years and the agency has never even visited their homes to take air samples.

Kathleen has stopped complaining to the YRCAA and is trying other ways to get clean air for her families and neighbors. She took the time to make this video. I made copies to send to DOH and impulsively provided copies to you and Dr. Everson.

As you know Bud Rogers and Jim Dyjak are on the Groundwater Management Area Advisory Committee. They are doing their part to make the air and water safe for all of us. Both men applied to be on the YRCAA board of Directors, I believe in 2015. Instead, the county commissioners appointed Dr. Steve Jones, a dairy nutritionist. Here is what Dr. Jones has to say about environmental justice:

From: Steven R. Jones, Ph.D. <srjones@uwresearch.net>
Sent time: 01/04/2015 03:45:32 PM
To: Gary Pruitt <gary@yrcaa.org>
Cc: Mike Letts <mike.letts@co.yakima.wa.us>; Rand Elliott <Rand.Elliott@co.yakima.wa.us>; Kevin Bouchey <Kevin.Bouchey@co.yakima.wa.us>
Subject: RE: Draft Strategic Plan
Attachments: Draft Strategic Plan w/ photos (Jones).docx

At your request I have enclosed some changes to the Strategic Plan document that was sent on the 18th of December. I have been out of town for most of that time and just completed this review. I see by the mailing I received on Friday that some of the issues I raise have been changed. The new document I received Friday simply reiterates most of the same material I have objections to. Objective 5 on page 15 is right out of the Environmental Justice rule book. It identifies a special class of people that require special treatment above and beyond the general public. Furthermore, these "highly impacted communities" are being designated by unelected agency bureaucrats. Don't get me wrong. We need bureaucrats that are sensitive to the public. Notwithstanding, we do not need to give those same dedicated public servants the right to choose which "highly impacted communities" need more air quality than others or special treatment under existing rules.

As I have commented in the redacted document enclosed, there should be no mention of "Environmental Justice" in this document. When you review the literature on the "Environmental Justice" movement, you find two advocacy groups. The first and most logical is the true environmentalists that believe if you damage the environment that you should have to correct the damage. This advocacy is logical but has been taken to a level that is in some cases punitive and restrictive to progress. The second advocacy group that supports "Environmental Justice" is far more dangerous. This advocacy group believes that the whole of the environment is a "collective" and anyone that used the environment for gain has disproportionately disadvantage someone or something else. This advocacy believes that anyone that has achieved gains should redistribute those gains to everyone or everything that has less or has been damaged. They use the terms "fair", "fairness", or "equity" to describe the reasons for "Environmental Justice". You can see these terms used throughout the agency Strategic Plan document. This advocacy group believes that the advances produced by Western civilization have been to the detriment of the environment and they want to be the group that tells us all how the environment will be portrayed. This second group is socialist at best and communist at the worst. I don't see how you can use the term "Environmental Justice" without being an advocate for one or both of these groups. I am opposed to the use of "Environmental Justice" in any form in this Strategic Plan document.

Thanks for the opportunity to comment on the plan. As it is currently written, I would have to vote no on approval. I think this document needs far more discussion than we have previously been exposed to. I do want to commend the work that you and the YRCAA staff performs for the community. I am very pleased to be a small part of what you do. I know that you must have worked diligently on this plan and I do not want to take away from the majority of it. I will apologize in advance if I offended you by my comments. That was not my intension. I simply do not believe in the "Environmental Justice" movement. At this time you, at least, know my opinion.

Best regards,

Steven R. Jones, Ph.D.
Colossal Orchards, Inc.

Here are some pictures:



Composting next to a home - 2010



Air on Hornby Road - 2014



Manure stacked next to a home 2015



Dust from turning compost across the street from Kathleen's home - 2017

* * * * *



Fox, Julie R (DOH)

To: Jean Mendoza Cc: eversont@ohsu.edu, Holly Myers, Cunningham, Rad N (DOH)

Nov 8, 2018 at 11:53 AM



[Details](#)

RE: DOH Review of Manure Land Application

Hello Jean Mendoza,

We are still planning to look into this but will not have a response until the new year. I imagine that sounds quite delayed; I can assure you that it has not been forgotten! I'll keep Dr. Everson and Holly Myers of Yakima Health District in the loop, along with my supervisor, Rad Cunningham (all cc'd).

Sincerely,

JULIE FOX, PhD, MHS

Air Quality Epidemiologist

Office of Environmental Public Health Sciences

Environmental Public Health Division

Washington State Department of Health

julie.fox@doh.wa.gov

From: Jean Mendoza [<mailto:jeanmendoza@icloud.com>]

Sent: Friday, November 2, 2018 11:34 PM

To: Fox, Julie R (DOH) <julie.fox@doh.wa.gov>

Subject: DOH Review of Manure Land Application

Hello Dr. Fox,

Can you give me an update on the DOH review of manure land application and the impact on air quality?

Thank you.

Jean Mendoza

* * * * *



Teresa Everson

To: Jean Mendoza Cc: Dean Effler, holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us, kay.funk@yakimawa.gov

Jun 11, 2019 at 11:28 AM

[Details](#)

RE: Request for a Meeting

Hi Jean-

Holly and I are both available after the 6/26/19 BOH meeting. Does 10-10:30a work on your end?

te

From: Jean Mendoza [jeanmendoza@icloud.com]

Sent: Monday, June 10, 2019 12:01 PM

To: Teresa Everson

Cc: Dean Effler; holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us; kay.funk@yakimawa.gov

Subject: Re: Request for a Meeting

Hello Dr. Everson,

The BOH meeting is scheduled for June 24. We are available to meet with you on June 26. Do you still have time?

Thanks

Jean Mendoza

On May 21, 2019 at 9:02 PM, Teresa Everson <eversont@ohsu.edu> wrote:

Sure thing.

te

From: Jean Mendoza [jeanmendoza@icloud.com]

Sent: Tuesday, May 21, 2019 3:24 PM

To: Teresa Everson

Cc: Dean Effler; holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us; kay.funk@yakimawa.gov; sbraden09@gmail.com

Subject: Re: Request for a Meeting

Hello Dr. Everson,

We need at least 30 minutes. More is better if there is discussion of implications.

There is a 50/50 chance that the WA State Board of Health will hold meetings on WAC 246-203-130 Keeping of Animals on June 26. Dr. Effler and I plan to attend. I know that Holly is on the mailing list for that meeting.

Can I get back to you after we hear from the BOH?

Thanks

Jean

On May 21, 2019 at 2:26 PM, Teresa Everson <eversont@ohsu.edu> wrote:

Thanks for reaching out, Jean.

I'm interested in hearing about your findings, but ideally would do this when Holly can also attend and unfortunately she needs to leave immediately after the 5/29/19 meeting.

Two questions:

Are you available after the 6/26/19 meeting? and

How much time do you need?

Dr. Everson

Teresa Everson, MD, MPH

Health Officer, Yakima Health District

Deputy Health Officer, Clark and Skamania Counties, Washington

Assistant Professor, OHSU Family Medicine

From: Jean Mendoza [jeanmendoza@icloud.com]

Sent: Monday, May 20, 2019 6:18 AM

To: Teresa Everson

Cc: Dean Effler; holly.myers@co.yakima.wa.us; kay.funk@yakimawa.gov

Subject: Request for a Meeting

Good Morning Dr. Everson,

When you attend the Yakima Health District board meeting on May 29 do you have time to meet with a few people from the Friends of Toppenish Creek? We have completed some air and water research in the Yakima Valley that we would like to share with you.

FOTC found some unexpectedly high levels of dioxins and furans in domestic well water. We have shared that information with the WA State Dept of Health and Ecology. We would like to talk to you about the results as well. FOTC found average ammonia levels in the ambient air at a site in the Lower Yakima Valley that exceed the MRL for chronic exposure.

Thanks and best wishes.

Jean Mendoza